

Undergraduate Thesis Assessment Rubric
Department of English, Faculty of Education, University of West Bohemia

Thesis Author: **Tomáš Lidinský**
 Title: *Scottish nationalism and its manifestations*
 Length: 36 pages
 Text Length: 31 pages

Assessment Criteria	Scale	Comments
1. Introduction is well written, brief, interesting, and compelling. It motivates the work and provides a clear statement of the examined issue. It presents and overview of the thesis.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	Too short, but still contains enough to hint at the problems to come: the author seems to be equating nationalism with national symbols whilst largely ignoring the political dimensions of the former.
2. The thesis shows the author's appropriate knowledge of the subject matter through the background/review of literature. The author presents information from a variety of quality electronic and print sources. Sources are relevant, balanced and include critical readings relating to the thesis or problem. Primary sources are included (if appropriate).	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	One would have to accept the author's somewhat misleading use of <i>nationalism</i> in his title in order to appreciate a list of references which, as indicated above, carries very little in terms of political literature.
3. The author carefully analyzed the information collected and drew appropriate and inventive conclusions supported by evidence. Ideas are richly supported with accurate details that develop the main point. The author's voice is evident.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	Well-known historical facts interspersed with potted biographies of famous Scotsmen do not offer much that is new; however the work is partially salvaged by the original research.
4. The thesis displays critical thinking and avoids simplistic description or summary of information.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	The author makes a reasonable effort to analyse his own questionnaire data.
5. Conclusion effectively restates the argument. It summarizes the main findings and follows logically from the analysis presented.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
6. The text is organized in a logical manner. It flows naturally and is easy to follow. Transitions, summaries and conclusions exist as appropriate. The author uses standard spelling, grammar, and punctuation.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
7. The language use is precise. The student makes proficient use of language in a way that is appropriate for the discipline and/or genre in which the student is writing.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
8. The thesis meets the general requirements (formatting, chapters, length, division into sections, etc.). References are cited properly within the text and a complete reference list is provided.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	

Final Comments & Questions

The fundamental problem of this work is that it never really gets to grips with the topic in the title: for some bizarre reason, 20th century nationalism – which one might reasonably assume to be central to the issue under discussion – receives a mere eight lines of text on p. 14 before the author turns his attention to traditional symbols and personalities that are widely displayed on posters, postcards and publicity materials used by the Scottish tourist board. With this in mind, the obvious question to ask is why the author chose not to focus more on political events.

Two further questions:

If knowledge of and support for Gaelic was considered a sufficiently relevant item to include in the questionnaire, how come the author did not devote more space to this in the theoretical section of his work?

Does the author see a difference between *national identity* and *nationalism*?

Recommended grade: **dobře**

Supervisor: Andrew Tollet

Date: 12th May 2014

Signature:

A handwritten signature in blue ink, consisting of a series of loops and strokes, positioned to the right of the 'Signature:' label.