

Undergraduate Thesis Assessment Rubric
Department of English, Faculty of Education, University of West Bohemia

Thesis Author: **Jakub Hlaváček**
 Title: *Transferred Meanings in Quotes by Famous People*
 Length: 69 pages
 Text Length: 57 pages

Assessment Criteria	Scale	Comments
1. Introduction is well written, brief, interesting, and compelling. It motivates the work and provides a clear statement of the examined issue. It presents and overview of the thesis.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
2. The thesis shows the author's appropriate knowledge of the subject matter through the background/review of literature. The author presents information from a variety of quality electronic and print sources. Sources are relevant, balanced and include critical readings relating to the thesis or problem. Primary sources are included (if appropriate).	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
3. The author carefully analyzed the information collected and drew appropriate and inventive conclusions supported by evidence. Ideas are richly supported with accurate details that develop the main point. The author's voice is evident.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
4. The thesis displays critical thinking and avoids simplistic description or summary of information.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
5. Conclusion effectively restates the argument. It summarizes the main findings and follows logically from the analysis presented.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
6. The text is organized in a logical manner. It flows naturally and is easy to follow. Transitions, summaries and conclusions exist as appropriate. The author uses standard spelling, grammar, and punctuation.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
7. The language use is precise. The student makes proficient use of language in a way that is appropriate for the discipline and/or genre in which the student is writing.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
8. The thesis meets the general requirements (formatting, chapters, length, division into sections, etc.). References are cited properly within the text and a complete reference list is provided.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	

The original idea behind this thesis is undoubtedly a very good one; however, the author's presentation of it is perhaps not quite the best. Neither the theoretical nor the practical sections present a fluent read: the former is little more than a glossary – moreover, one in which the numbering of every single item as a separate subsection becomes more an irritating distraction than an aid to orientation; the latter section is primarily a series of quotations followed by a brief explanatory comment for the benefit of readers who may not immediately appreciate the fact that if someone says, for example, "float like a butterfly", they are making a comparison which involves floating and a butterfly.

The most interesting part of the work is the translation of the quotes into Czech. It is only a pity the author chose to restrict his selection to a mere 15 items. Granted, he explains his reasons for so doing but that merely leads one to reflect on how the main focus of the thesis could have been different from the outset and more appropriate quotations chosen accordingly.

As regards the criteria for the original selection of 80 quotes, we are told that *they must be unambiguously attributed to a single person. That person must be a public figure, must hold a degree of public notoriety, or their existence must be common knowledge* (p. 28). It is not clear why "notoriety" should be a precondition, nor where precisely the quotes were taken from for the purposes of this work when several of them have been reproduced incorrectly:

32) Early to bed and early to rise makes man healthy, wealthy and wise

33) A fox should not be on the jury at goose's trial

39) [...] I look in the mirror and see Austin powers staring at me

49) It is sobering to think that Mozart was when he had already been dead a year

50) I have a mood poisoning. Must be something I hate

59) It's hard to be an artist, it's hard to be anything, it's hard to be

61) America without Her soldiers is like a God without His angels

80) A mind is like a parachute. It does not work, when it is closed

(The last mentioned is attributed to Frank Zappa; however, internet sources suggest the precise wording should be *A mind is like a parachute. It doesn't work if it is not open*. That said, the idea behind the words apparently originates from Thomas Dewar: *Minds are like parachutes - they only function when open.*)

Yet, for all its obvious faults, the work is not completely without merit and, given a good oral defence, could be classified as **dobře**.

Questions

(a) Might it not have been better to group the quotes according to category (e.g. Berra, G.W. Bush, Shackelford, Tyson) rather than authors' names?

(b) In the Neil Armstrong quote on p. 30, was it anything other than a misplaced sense of political correctness that prompted the author of this thesis to substitute *humanity* for *mankind*?

(c) In section 2.3, item 1), is it really the case that *rozčtvrcen* on its own covers the idea of *drawn and quartered*? Somehow it seems more likely that, for whatever reason, the translator has simply chosen to omit *tažen*.

(d) On p. 57 we are told: *Quotes are recorded utterances from people and are translated quite literally unlike, for example, idioms, which are set expressions with established equivalents in different languages*. If this is to be accepted as a general principle of translation theory, how are we supposed to deal with quotes which themselves contain idioms?

Reviewer: Andrew Tollet

Date: 8th June 2020

Signature: